



1  
00:00:06,200 --> 00:00:04,070  
okay-y sigh is consciousnesses only hope

2  
00:00:08,120 --> 00:00:06,210  
I've changed his title a little bit from

3  
00:00:10,520 --> 00:00:08,130  
what it says in your program both in

4  
00:00:12,499 --> 00:00:10,530  
light of the talk I'm responding to and

5  
00:00:15,230 --> 00:00:12,509  
further thoughts on exactly what the

6  
00:00:17,090 --> 00:00:15,240  
point was I was trying to make and the

7  
00:00:19,519 --> 00:00:17,100  
talk I'm responding to let's see if I

8  
00:00:23,330 --> 00:00:19,529  
can figure this out yes was given by

9  
00:00:25,009 --> 00:00:23,340  
Susan Blackmore back in 1996 her title

10  
00:00:28,040 --> 00:00:25,019  
was why sigh tells us nothing about

11  
00:00:29,900 --> 00:00:28,050  
consciousness now I pick on Susan even

12  
00:00:32,240 --> 00:00:29,910  
though this is what 12 years after the

13  
00:00:35,990 --> 00:00:32,250

fact for a couple reasons first of all

14

00:00:38,780 --> 00:00:36,000

her perspective mirrors pretty much that

15

00:00:41,780 --> 00:00:38,790

about about consciousness the the same

16

00:00:44,590 --> 00:00:41,790

perspective this kind of events and the

17

00:00:49,100 --> 00:00:44,600

psychology and the philosophy

18

00:00:50,540 --> 00:00:49,110

disciplines in general ok our concept is

19

00:00:52,760 --> 00:00:50,550

we'll see is a little bit broader than

20

00:00:54,139 --> 00:00:52,770

that but but she's got a pretty pretty

21

00:00:56,240 --> 00:00:54,149

straightforward academic view of

22

00:00:59,900 --> 00:00:56,250

consciousness and she's really the only

23

00:01:02,540 --> 00:00:59,910

one that's addressed this issue of SCI

24

00:01:08,030 --> 00:01:02,550

in relation to consciousness in a kind

25

00:01:08,810 --> 00:01:08,040

of a sceptical way her argument goes

26

00:01:11,710 --> 00:01:08,820

something like this

27

00:01:13,760 --> 00:01:11,720

first of all ESP is probably

28

00:01:16,730 --> 00:01:13,770

non-existent she doesn't come right out

29

00:01:20,630 --> 00:01:16,740

and declare it non-existent she started

30

00:01:22,789 --> 00:01:20,640

off life as a parapsychologist very much

31

00:01:24,020 --> 00:01:22,799

disposed to believing in it and then

32

00:01:25,370 --> 00:01:24,030

over a series of disappointing

33

00:01:27,800 --> 00:01:25,380

experiments concluded that there

34

00:01:29,690 --> 00:01:27,810

probably wasn't anything to it but they

35

00:01:31,550 --> 00:01:29,700

weren't inconclusive enough that she was

36

00:01:35,569 --> 00:01:31,560

ready to reject the the hypothesis

37

00:01:37,850 --> 00:01:35,579

altogether that ESP exists so I'm not

38

00:01:40,480 --> 00:01:37,860

going to say much more about that part

39

00:01:42,950 --> 00:01:40,490

of her argument that site doesn't exist

40

00:01:45,530 --> 00:01:42,960

that's a whole topic in itself and most

41

00:01:49,490 --> 00:01:45,540

of us are of the other mind based on

42

00:01:51,170 --> 00:01:49,500

evidence that we've seen ok one thing I

43

00:01:54,590 --> 00:01:51,180

do want to comment and I read her book

44

00:01:56,060 --> 00:01:54,600

and I found it very a very sincere

45

00:01:58,700 --> 00:01:56,070

effort to try and get to the bottom of

46

00:02:01,340 --> 00:01:58,710

what her experiences were but I think

47

00:02:02,980 --> 00:02:01,350

that throughout it has the demonstrates

48

00:02:06,800 --> 00:02:02,990

the failing that many people get

49

00:02:09,440 --> 00:02:06,810

interested in ESP fall into and that is

50

00:02:11,089 --> 00:02:09,450

to lay too much faith in a certain

51  
00:02:13,380 --> 00:02:11,099  
paradigm relate to much faith in a

52  
00:02:16,320 --> 00:02:13,390  
certain way of thinking about it

53  
00:02:18,630 --> 00:02:16,330  
and not being ready or able or willing

54  
00:02:19,920 --> 00:02:18,640  
to branch out and consider things from a

55  
00:02:21,870 --> 00:02:19,930  
different perspective questions one

56  
00:02:24,240 --> 00:02:21,880  
question ones assumptions think of a

57  
00:02:25,470 --> 00:02:24,250  
different way of approaching it she

58  
00:02:26,940 --> 00:02:25,480  
seems to have gotten kind of locked into

59  
00:02:28,920 --> 00:02:26,950  
a certain perspective and that happened

60  
00:02:33,210 --> 00:02:28,930  
to be a perspective that didn't work and

61  
00:02:34,949 --> 00:02:33,220  
hence her disappointment okay so second

62  
00:02:36,150 --> 00:02:34,959  
part of argument is that even if he SP

63  
00:02:38,810 --> 00:02:36,160

does exist and this should have been

64

00:02:42,390 --> 00:02:38,820

sigh every time you see ESP thinks I

65

00:02:44,630 --> 00:02:42,400

even if ESP or sight does exist it gives

66

00:02:47,729 --> 00:02:44,640

no evidence for consciousness and

67

00:02:49,410 --> 00:02:47,739

further neuroscience hasn't found any

68

00:02:51,830 --> 00:02:49,420

evidence of consciousness you they have

69

00:02:55,740 --> 00:02:51,840

found no location in the brain where

70

00:02:57,840 --> 00:02:55,750

where consciousness exists and where

71

00:03:00,210 --> 00:02:57,850

consciousness is processed or whatever

72

00:03:01,770 --> 00:03:00,220

this is all more broadly known as the

73

00:03:03,840 --> 00:03:01,780

argument from physiology in the

74

00:03:05,490 --> 00:03:03,850

philosophy of mind the idea that science

75

00:03:07,949 --> 00:03:05,500

hasn't found anything that isn't

76

00:03:10,110 --> 00:03:07,959

physical in the brain and the conclusion

77

00:03:13,530 --> 00:03:10,120

is therefore we can safely presume that

78

00:03:17,970 --> 00:03:13,540

there is nothing that isn't physical in

79

00:03:19,560 --> 00:03:17,980

mental or or brain processes okay so

80

00:03:21,180 --> 00:03:19,570

this raises two questions that we have

81

00:03:23,670 --> 00:03:21,190

to kind of address first what is

82

00:03:25,860 --> 00:03:23,680

consciousness and there are a couple of

83

00:03:30,030 --> 00:03:25,870

answers to this one is the easy answer

84

00:03:33,720 --> 00:03:30,040

nobody knows the true answer is

85

00:03:35,780 --> 00:03:33,730

everybody knows but you just can't

86

00:03:37,949 --> 00:03:35,790

describe it or explain it to anyone else

87

00:03:40,110 --> 00:03:37,959

consciousness is a very profoundly

88

00:03:42,150 --> 00:03:40,120

subjective experience and anytime you

89

00:03:43,590 --> 00:03:42,160

try and explain what your conscious

90

00:03:45,630 --> 00:03:43,600

experience is like to someone else you

91

00:03:47,460 --> 00:03:45,640

find yourself having to rely on words

92

00:03:50,250 --> 00:03:47,470

that you hope have the same meaning of

93

00:03:52,199 --> 00:03:50,260

the person you're talking to as opposed

94

00:03:53,580 --> 00:03:52,209

to maybe they have a whole different

95

00:03:55,140 --> 00:03:53,590

understanding of what you're saying okay

96

00:03:56,789 --> 00:03:55,150

we never know

97

00:03:59,580 --> 00:03:56,799

that's part of the mind-body problem and

98

00:04:00,750 --> 00:03:59,590

the problem of other minds we assume

99

00:04:02,310 --> 00:04:00,760

other people have minds

100

00:04:05,430 --> 00:04:02,320

although oftentimes when you're on the

101  
00:04:08,699 --> 00:04:05,440  
highway you're not so sure okay how do

102  
00:04:11,250 --> 00:04:08,709  
we define consciousness well this is a

103  
00:04:13,430 --> 00:04:11,260  
very vague sort of rough-and-ready

104  
00:04:15,420 --> 00:04:13,440  
definition I came up with on the fly

105  
00:04:17,190 --> 00:04:15,430  
everybody's got their own version of

106  
00:04:18,900 --> 00:04:17,200  
this but I'd say it's the mental

107  
00:04:22,469 --> 00:04:18,910  
experience of perceiving and tending

108  
00:04:23,670 --> 00:04:22,479  
apprehending and attending to okay now

109  
00:04:25,080 --> 00:04:23,680  
there's lots of words in there that need

110  
00:04:25,690 --> 00:04:25,090  
further definition before you know what

111  
00:04:28,120 --> 00:04:25,700  
the heck I'm talk

112  
00:04:30,880 --> 00:04:28,130  
about so I'm gonna defer to Susan here

113  
00:04:34,030 --> 00:04:30,890

again for a moment and this is from

114

00:04:36,370 --> 00:04:34,040

another paper she wrote on consciousness

115

00:04:39,310 --> 00:04:36,380

and I'm gonna read from this and you can

116

00:04:41,080 --> 00:04:39,320

see you can follow along she says I felt

117

00:04:42,940 --> 00:04:41,090

happily into consciousness yesterday

118

00:04:45,490 --> 00:04:42,950

walking high on the Devon cliffs with

119

00:04:48,010 --> 00:04:45,500

the seagulls crying overhead the grass

120

00:04:50,920 --> 00:04:48,020

brushing against my boots was so well

121

00:04:52,780 --> 00:04:50,930

grassy it was green and lush and

122

00:04:57,520 --> 00:04:52,790

glistening and changing all the time as

123

00:05:01,210 --> 00:04:57,530

I strode along this grassiness was my

124

00:05:04,630 --> 00:05:01,220

experience only I had just this vision

125

00:05:06,910 --> 00:05:04,640

from just this point of view yet I also

126  
00:05:09,940 --> 00:05:06,920  
believe that I have objectively realized

127  
00:05:12,540 --> 00:05:09,950  
the taken light and objectively existing

128  
00:05:16,120 --> 00:05:12,550  
brain cells in my head that make me see

129  
00:05:17,650 --> 00:05:16,130  
but how can this be how can objective

130  
00:05:20,230 --> 00:05:17,660  
things like brain cells produce

131  
00:05:23,410 --> 00:05:20,240  
subjective experiences like the feeling

132  
00:05:24,820 --> 00:05:23,420  
that I am striding through the grass and

133  
00:05:27,310 --> 00:05:24,830  
that of course is the problem of

134  
00:05:31,230 --> 00:05:27,320  
consciousness for philosophy of mind for

135  
00:05:34,750 --> 00:05:31,240  
psychology how is it that brain cells

136  
00:05:37,720 --> 00:05:34,760  
hardwired functional kinds of entities

137  
00:05:40,570 --> 00:05:37,730  
in the physical brain how can they

138  
00:05:43,570 --> 00:05:40,580

produce the experiences we have when we

139

00:05:45,220 --> 00:05:43,580

have a conscious experience there seems

140

00:05:46,840 --> 00:05:45,230

to be a disconnect and it's been address

141

00:05:48,730 --> 00:05:46,850

in a couple of different ways David Shaw

142

00:05:50,740 --> 00:05:48,740

more calls it Chalmers calls it the hard

143

00:05:53,500 --> 00:05:50,750

problem the problem to try and figure

144

00:06:00,250 --> 00:05:53,510

out how you can explain how things feel

145

00:06:02,050 --> 00:06:00,260

in terms of fMRI and EEG and firing of

146

00:06:03,940 --> 00:06:02,060

synapses and all of that kind of stuff

147

00:06:07,900 --> 00:06:03,950

that that we try and explain everything

148

00:06:10,300 --> 00:06:07,910

else in terms of joe levine calls it the

149

00:06:14,140 --> 00:06:10,310

explanatory gap but it's essentially the

150

00:06:16,690 --> 00:06:14,150

same problem okay so one way of getting

151

00:06:17,950 --> 00:06:16,700

is that this was by Thomas Nagel had

152

00:06:20,170 --> 00:06:17,960

this interesting little article II

153

00:06:22,120 --> 00:06:20,180

basically what is it like to be a bat

154

00:06:24,070 --> 00:06:22,130

and so oftentimes people refer to

155

00:06:27,520 --> 00:06:24,080

consciousness as the experience of what

156

00:06:30,790 --> 00:06:27,530

it is like to be you or to be me or to

157

00:06:32,710 --> 00:06:30,800

be anyone else they the interesting

158

00:06:34,600 --> 00:06:32,720

metaphor here was okay a bat there's a

159

00:06:36,790 --> 00:06:34,610

certain way it is to be a bat and it's

160

00:06:38,320 --> 00:06:36,800

not like being a human and yet the

161

00:06:39,580 --> 00:06:38,330

things that distinguish being a bat from

162

00:06:44,460 --> 00:06:39,590

being a human

163

00:06:46,780 --> 00:06:44,470

these kind of non definable things

164

00:06:49,030 --> 00:06:46,790

experience what they call phenomenal

165

00:06:52,120 --> 00:06:49,040

experiences or qualia has I'll use the

166

00:06:54,400 --> 00:06:52,130

term very often here okay so these are

167

00:06:56,770 --> 00:06:54,410

the things that go into making up what

168

00:06:58,900 --> 00:06:56,780

it's like experience alright perception

169

00:07:00,580 --> 00:06:58,910

the standard sensual perception the

170

00:07:03,190 --> 00:07:00,590

sensory input then processed by the

171

00:07:06,090 --> 00:07:03,200

brain and producing these experiences

172

00:07:08,170 --> 00:07:06,100

cognition the processing of information

173

00:07:12,010 --> 00:07:08,180

phenomenal experience the actual

174

00:07:14,620 --> 00:07:12,020

experiences we have of red or pain or

175

00:07:18,310 --> 00:07:14,630

the smell of cinnamon and those kinds of

176

00:07:21,070 --> 00:07:18,320

things and intentionality the the sense

177

00:07:22,900 --> 00:07:21,080

we have of relating to the rest of

178

00:07:25,360 --> 00:07:22,910

universe with a sense of about mrs.

179

00:07:28,600 --> 00:07:25,370

Brentano called it where when we regard

180

00:07:30,670 --> 00:07:28,610

a glass full of water we are aware of

181

00:07:33,180 --> 00:07:30,680

that thing as an object as an entity in

182

00:07:36,400 --> 00:07:33,190

itself sitting there in a way that isn't

183

00:07:37,600 --> 00:07:36,410

isn't expressible we just we just know

184

00:07:39,070 --> 00:07:37,610

it's there and we're aware of that

185

00:07:41,550 --> 00:07:39,080

that's a kind of aboutness that is the

186

00:07:44,680 --> 00:07:41,560

root of intentionality

187

00:07:46,330 --> 00:07:44,690

so we addressed the first question very

188

00:07:48,340 --> 00:07:46,340

inadequately what is consciousness let's

189

00:07:49,750 --> 00:07:48,350

talk about this a second question that's

190

00:07:52,750 --> 00:07:49,760

perhaps more important to this lecture

191

00:07:54,940 --> 00:07:52,760

why is consciousness in trouble why is

192

00:07:57,220 --> 00:07:54,950

it that conscious and the consciousness

193

00:07:58,150 --> 00:07:57,230

needs hope why is it the consciousness

194

00:08:00,970 --> 00:07:58,160

needs help

195

00:08:03,640 --> 00:08:00,980

why is sight not of any help to

196

00:08:05,920 --> 00:08:03,650

consciousness what's the problem okay so

197

00:08:07,300 --> 00:08:05,930

here's the threat to consciousness well

198

00:08:10,150 --> 00:08:07,310

the threat to consciousness rather is

199

00:08:12,640 --> 00:08:10,160

the threat to mind itself it goes back

200

00:08:15,970 --> 00:08:12,650

to a much bigger argument whether mind

201  
00:08:17,830 --> 00:08:15,980  
just is the brain whether what we

202  
00:08:20,710 --> 00:08:17,840  
perceive as our mental experiences are

203  
00:08:22,420 --> 00:08:20,720  
nothing more than the end product of a

204  
00:08:24,630 --> 00:08:22,430  
whole bunch of neuronal firings and

205  
00:08:27,070 --> 00:08:24,640  
electrochemical processes and and

206  
00:08:29,170 --> 00:08:27,080  
stimulation stimulation of nerve fibers

207  
00:08:32,800 --> 00:08:29,180  
and all that kind of thing if the mind

208  
00:08:34,180 --> 00:08:32,810  
is only that then it's just the brain or

209  
00:08:35,980 --> 00:08:34,190  
whether the mind itself is something

210  
00:08:38,860 --> 00:08:35,990  
unique and something up over and above

211  
00:08:40,840 --> 00:08:38,870  
that at least in some respects and the

212  
00:08:42,550 --> 00:08:40,850  
fight started out with just mind versus

213  
00:08:46,120 --> 00:08:42,560

brain way back starting with Descartes

214

00:08:48,520 --> 00:08:46,130

and proceeding up to today but over time

215

00:08:51,580 --> 00:08:48,530

science has paired away the things that

216

00:08:53,200 --> 00:08:51,590

we thought were mental about the mind

217

00:08:57,190 --> 00:08:53,210

and assigned it to the physical

218

00:08:58,780 --> 00:08:57,200

and in a sense the ho of consciousness

219

00:09:00,940 --> 00:08:58,790

the question of consciousness is all

220

00:09:04,390 --> 00:09:00,950

that's left in the mind versus brain

221

00:09:06,250 --> 00:09:04,400

battle okay so the threat consciousness

222

00:09:10,510 --> 00:09:06,260

is the threat to mind itself as a

223

00:09:15,220 --> 00:09:10,520

distinct entity mind as mind rather than

224

00:09:17,740 --> 00:09:15,230

mind as some physical product so let's

225

00:09:20,020 --> 00:09:17,750

talk about physicalism which is at root

226

00:09:22,570 --> 00:09:20,030

that premise that the mind just is the

227

00:09:24,670 --> 00:09:22,580

brain okay here here are the premises of

228

00:09:29,260 --> 00:09:24,680

physicalism only physical forces and

229

00:09:31,210 --> 00:09:29,270

states are causative all aspects of mind

230

00:09:35,290 --> 00:09:31,220

are the result of underlying physical

231

00:09:37,990 --> 00:09:35,300

processes and there isn't anything in

232

00:09:40,180 --> 00:09:38,000

the universe that isn't a consequence of

233

00:09:43,210 --> 00:09:40,190

matter or energy or some combination of

234

00:09:44,830 --> 00:09:43,220

the two and if there was something that

235

00:09:47,620 --> 00:09:44,840

was not a consequence of matter or

236

00:09:48,940 --> 00:09:47,630

energy it wouldn't matter at all to the

237

00:09:51,010 --> 00:09:48,950

physical universe it would be irrelevant

238

00:09:53,020 --> 00:09:51,020

to it that's for you those of you who

239

00:09:55,260 --> 00:09:53,030

like very long words with lots of

240

00:09:58,300 --> 00:09:55,270

syllables that's called the

241

00:10:02,560 --> 00:09:58,310

epiphenomenalism that that's the premise

242

00:10:05,080 --> 00:10:02,570

there okay so according to physical

243

00:10:08,740 --> 00:10:05,090

isn't mind and therefore by extension

244

00:10:12,130 --> 00:10:08,750

consciousness is physical and only

245

00:10:17,140 --> 00:10:12,140

physical okay this poses some problems

246

00:10:19,750 --> 00:10:17,150

for us okay first off death survival if

247

00:10:23,170 --> 00:10:19,760

everything about human nature is only

248

00:10:25,780 --> 00:10:23,180

physical then forget about death

249

00:10:27,910 --> 00:10:25,790

survival there's no there's no substance

250

00:10:29,410 --> 00:10:27,920

to that and this is why you run into

251  
00:10:31,650 --> 00:10:29,420  
when you talk to mainstream scientists

252  
00:10:35,080 --> 00:10:31,660  
and skeptics who are very much

253  
00:10:37,150 --> 00:10:35,090  
subscribers to the physicalist thesis

254  
00:10:38,680 --> 00:10:37,160  
that's why they dismissed the idea of

255  
00:10:40,660 --> 00:10:38,690  
death survival or any of these kind of

256  
00:10:43,960 --> 00:10:40,670  
things does because if physical in the

257  
00:10:45,550 --> 00:10:43,970  
physical ISM is true then you don't

258  
00:10:47,500 --> 00:10:45,560  
survive death nor are there any

259  
00:10:49,780 --> 00:10:47,510  
spiritual components in universe any

260  
00:10:51,520 --> 00:10:49,790  
sorts of spiritual experiences at least

261  
00:10:55,150 --> 00:10:51,530  
in the terms that has traditionally been

262  
00:10:58,180 --> 00:10:55,160  
regarded as that all religious claims

263  
00:11:00,520 --> 00:10:58,190

are bankrupt except those that deal only

264

00:11:05,199 --> 00:11:00,530

with sociology or psychology okay and

265

00:11:07,419 --> 00:11:05,209

perhaps most importantly freewill is

266

00:11:09,730 --> 00:11:07,429

then succumbs to determinism and

267

00:11:12,369 --> 00:11:09,740

indeterminism if you if physicalism is

268

00:11:14,769 --> 00:11:12,379

true there's a growing consensus you

269

00:11:16,900 --> 00:11:14,779

lose free will in any robust sense of

270

00:11:22,299 --> 00:11:16,910

that term so you see these are pretty

271

00:11:24,489 --> 00:11:22,309

major implications for individual and

272

00:11:28,090 --> 00:11:24,499

for society at large so physical isn't

273

00:11:29,889 --> 00:11:28,100

true physicalism is true it can it will

274

00:11:33,509 --> 00:11:29,899

change things dramatically it already

275

00:11:37,359 --> 00:11:33,519

has started to do that okay however

276

00:11:39,669 --> 00:11:37,369

excuse me consciousness itself is used

277

00:11:41,259 --> 00:11:39,679

as an argument against physicalism it

278

00:11:42,759 --> 00:11:41,269

sounds a little bit circular right

279

00:11:44,549 --> 00:11:42,769

physical isms trying to prove the

280

00:11:46,660 --> 00:11:44,559

consciousness is physical but

281

00:11:48,850 --> 00:11:46,670

consciousness itself is using to rebut

282

00:11:50,980 --> 00:11:48,860

that argument okay it's not as circular

283

00:11:53,559 --> 00:11:50,990

as it sounds but it is actually in vain

284

00:11:55,689 --> 00:11:53,569

is all explained here okay a number of

285

00:11:57,220 --> 00:11:55,699

our of interesting arguments and thought

286

00:11:59,350 --> 00:11:57,230

experiments have been used to try and

287

00:12:02,139 --> 00:11:59,360

show that consciousness is consciousness

288

00:12:03,489 --> 00:12:02,149

is not physical at least in any sense

289

00:12:05,079 --> 00:12:03,499

that the physicalist would like it to be

290

00:12:06,429 --> 00:12:05,089

I'm not going to explain all these

291

00:12:07,689 --> 00:12:06,439

arguments we don't have enough time but

292

00:12:11,619 --> 00:12:07,699

there are many interesting ones they're

293

00:12:12,999 --> 00:12:11,629

very colorfully entitled you got married

294

00:12:15,249 --> 00:12:13,009

the color scientists the knowledge

295

00:12:17,109 --> 00:12:15,259

argument I already talked about what it

296

00:12:19,090 --> 00:12:17,119

is like to be a bat there's the zombie

297

00:12:21,489 --> 00:12:19,100

argument and there's the inverted

298

00:12:23,079 --> 00:12:21,499

spectrum argument and perhaps in the QA

299

00:12:25,179 --> 00:12:23,089

or sometime after if you're not familiar

300

00:12:26,559 --> 00:12:25,189

with these arguments I can I can touch

301  
00:12:28,660 --> 00:12:26,569  
on them for you for a minute but all of

302  
00:12:31,799 --> 00:12:28,670  
these are used to show through various

303  
00:12:35,049 --> 00:12:31,809  
clever argumentation methods that

304  
00:12:36,249 --> 00:12:35,059  
consciousness is non-physical okay or at

305  
00:12:38,739 --> 00:12:36,259  
least that it's an argument against

306  
00:12:41,470 --> 00:12:38,749  
physicalism unfortunately they don't

307  
00:12:43,809 --> 00:12:41,480  
succeed and I'll explain why physicalism

308  
00:12:46,059 --> 00:12:43,819  
strikes back in order to understand how

309  
00:12:47,859 --> 00:12:46,069  
strikes back let's talk about how we

310  
00:12:50,739 --> 00:12:47,869  
establish the truth of physicalism in

311  
00:12:53,169 --> 00:12:50,749  
the first place first of all physicalism

312  
00:12:54,999 --> 00:12:53,179  
is proved by inductive evidence okay

313  
00:12:56,400 --> 00:12:55,009

leading to what's known as inference to

314

00:13:00,609 --> 00:12:56,410

the best explanation

315

00:13:03,609 --> 00:13:00,619

physicalism is not a deduced proposition

316

00:13:06,850 --> 00:13:03,619

it is not proved like math like a math

317

00:13:08,710 --> 00:13:06,860

problem it is proved and in fact you can

318

00:13:10,030 --> 00:13:08,720

throw out the word prove because really

319

00:13:12,759 --> 00:13:10,040

when you get right down to it science

320

00:13:15,850 --> 00:13:12,769

doesn't deal improve science deals in

321

00:13:17,710 --> 00:13:15,860

preponderance of evidence and so the

322

00:13:18,569 --> 00:13:17,720

better your evidence the more likely or

323

00:13:20,699 --> 00:13:18,579

your

324

00:13:23,569 --> 00:13:20,709

theory is to be true and that's

325

00:13:24,780 --> 00:13:23,579

basically how physicalism is established

326

00:13:28,559 --> 00:13:24,790

okay

327

00:13:30,150 --> 00:13:28,569

so it involves enumerative induction so

328

00:13:32,009 --> 00:13:30,160

if you have one crow and then you find

329

00:13:33,720 --> 00:13:32,019

another crow and they're black and you

330

00:13:35,579 --> 00:13:33,730

find another crow and it's black and

331

00:13:37,019 --> 00:13:35,589

then you find another crow in this black

332

00:13:38,819 --> 00:13:37,029

eventually you conclude that any black

333

00:13:41,340 --> 00:13:38,829

crow you're going to encounter is black

334

00:13:45,239 --> 00:13:41,350

right that's completely familiar at all

335

00:13:47,639 --> 00:13:45,249

all right and how this argument works

336

00:13:51,539 --> 00:13:47,649

out with physicalism in science in

337

00:13:53,100 --> 00:13:51,549

general is that anytime we encounter a

338

00:13:55,530 --> 00:13:53,110

phenomenon that we think is supernatural

339

00:13:57,900 --> 00:13:55,540

when we investigate it very thoroughly

340

00:13:59,160 --> 00:13:57,910

we discover that there are physical

341

00:14:01,199 --> 00:13:59,170

explanations that are far better than

342

00:14:03,389 --> 00:14:01,209

any supernatural explanations so for

343

00:14:05,519 --> 00:14:03,399

example we have this view that disease

344

00:14:07,109 --> 00:14:05,529

is caused by evil demons that enter a

345

00:14:08,639 --> 00:14:07,119

person's body and then the witch doctor

346

00:14:10,350 --> 00:14:08,649

comes and shakes his rattle and blow

347

00:14:12,809 --> 00:14:10,360

some smoke and it chases the demons out

348

00:14:15,269 --> 00:14:12,819

and the person is cured but if you get a

349

00:14:17,009 --> 00:14:15,279

stubborn demon they die okay so you all

350

00:14:19,499 --> 00:14:17,019

bets are off the witch doctor does his

351

00:14:21,539 --> 00:14:19,509

best okay well then later on the germ

352

00:14:23,100 --> 00:14:21,549

theory comes along discovers that no

353

00:14:24,389 --> 00:14:23,110

diseases are caused by these little tiny

354

00:14:25,679 --> 00:14:24,399

things to get into the body and there

355

00:14:28,229 --> 00:14:25,689

are these things you can do to combat

356

00:14:29,429 --> 00:14:28,239

those terms and in fact your cure rate

357

00:14:31,559 --> 00:14:29,439

goes up dramatically

358

00:14:35,189 --> 00:14:31,569

that's evidence very strong evidence

359

00:14:37,590 --> 00:14:35,199

that the evil demons supernatural

360

00:14:38,939 --> 00:14:37,600

hypothesis is false and that you have a

361

00:14:42,569 --> 00:14:38,949

physical explanation that works very

362

00:14:44,579 --> 00:14:42,579

well okay so you have this hypothesis

363

00:14:45,720 --> 00:14:44,589

that angels are pushing the planets

364

00:14:48,659 --> 00:14:45,730

around and that's what causes the

365

00:14:50,429 --> 00:14:48,669

movement of the planets well later on

366

00:14:52,079 --> 00:14:50,439

Copernicus and Kepler and Newton come

367

00:14:54,059 --> 00:14:52,089

along and we discover that no you can

368

00:14:56,549 --> 00:14:54,069

explain the movement of the planets by

369

00:14:58,619 --> 00:14:56,559

very plausible physical mechanisms we

370

00:15:01,350 --> 00:14:58,629

don't need angels anymore okay so you've

371

00:15:03,030 --> 00:15:01,360

established two cases where a physical

372

00:15:04,679 --> 00:15:03,040

explanation is far better than a

373

00:15:06,269 --> 00:15:04,689

supernatural explanation and after

374

00:15:08,309 --> 00:15:06,279

you've done dozens of those in hundreds

375

00:15:09,659 --> 00:15:08,319

and thousands of those you come to the

376

00:15:13,249 --> 00:15:09,669

conclusion through inference to the best

377

00:15:15,389 --> 00:15:13,259

explanation that anytime you encounter a

378

00:15:16,919 --> 00:15:15,399

supernatural explanation for a

379

00:15:19,229 --> 00:15:16,929

phenomenon that happens here in the

380

00:15:20,879 --> 00:15:19,239

physical world there's probably going to

381

00:15:22,710 --> 00:15:20,889

be a physical explanation for it so you

382

00:15:25,350 --> 00:15:22,720

can forget the supernatural explanation

383

00:15:28,350 --> 00:15:25,360

that's kind of how it works okay

384

00:15:30,090 --> 00:15:28,360

everybody clear on that okay

385

00:15:31,499 --> 00:15:30,100

so you get an induction and you get

386

00:15:32,400 --> 00:15:31,509

inference to the best explanation I

387

00:15:33,720 --> 00:15:32,410

couldn't could

388

00:15:36,420 --> 00:15:33,730

resist putting in this word in

389

00:15:37,020 --> 00:15:36,430

parentheses abduction it's not what

390

00:15:41,070 --> 00:15:37,030

you're thinking

391

00:15:42,660 --> 00:15:41,080

okay abduction actually refers to the

392

00:15:43,710 --> 00:15:42,670

logical principle of inference to the

393

00:15:45,990 --> 00:15:43,720

best explanation

394

00:15:49,910 --> 00:15:46,000

among other things of course but that's

395

00:15:52,350 --> 00:15:49,920

what it means here okay so because

396

00:15:54,540 --> 00:15:52,360

physicalism is proved by inductive

397

00:15:59,060 --> 00:15:54,550

evidence through empirical research

398

00:16:01,110 --> 00:15:59,070

right logical and deductive arguments

399

00:16:03,860 --> 00:16:01,120

can't disprove it

400

00:16:05,490 --> 00:16:03,870

and so often it's people launch

401  
00:16:06,630 --> 00:16:05,500  
philosophical arguments against

402  
00:16:08,940 --> 00:16:06,640  
physicalism and they just don't go

403  
00:16:11,370 --> 00:16:08,950  
anywhere because they don't get it what

404  
00:16:14,460 --> 00:16:11,380  
actually grounds physicalism the only

405  
00:16:15,780 --> 00:16:14,470  
way to deal with if you so how are you

406  
00:16:17,810 --> 00:16:15,790  
how do you deal with how do you fight

407  
00:16:20,100 --> 00:16:17,820  
physicalism the only way to do that is

408  
00:16:22,580 --> 00:16:20,110  
with a counter example so called white

409  
00:16:24,660 --> 00:16:22,590  
crow everybody's heard this term

410  
00:16:26,100 --> 00:16:24,670  
everybody thinks it came from what well

411  
00:16:27,480 --> 00:16:26,110  
the different people think comes from

412  
00:16:29,670 --> 00:16:27,490  
different people but as far as I can

413  
00:16:31,680 --> 00:16:29,680

tell it originated with William James

414

00:16:34,080 --> 00:16:31,690

he's when the first used the term white

415

00:16:39,390 --> 00:16:34,090

crow and he was referring to refuting

416

00:16:40,560 --> 00:16:39,400

and in an enumerative induction the only

417

00:16:43,530 --> 00:16:40,570

way to do it is with a counter example

418

00:16:44,880 --> 00:16:43,540

okay so here we have all these crows and

419

00:16:46,860 --> 00:16:44,890

they're all black well what happens if

420

00:16:50,130 --> 00:16:46,870

we find a white crow well we disproved

421

00:16:53,730 --> 00:16:50,140

our induction but it doesn't work quite

422

00:16:55,860 --> 00:16:53,740

so easily that way in modern science one

423

00:17:01,520 --> 00:16:55,870

white crow isn't enough real quick why

424

00:17:03,600 --> 00:17:01,530

isn't one white crow enough huh

425

00:17:04,260 --> 00:17:03,610

replication right it could be an

426

00:17:07,200 --> 00:17:04,270

accident

427

00:17:08,520 --> 00:17:07,210

maybe that crow flew through a radiation

428

00:17:11,190 --> 00:17:08,530

stream you know or whatever we've got

429

00:17:15,090 --> 00:17:11,200

mutated who knows right you got to have

430

00:17:17,160 --> 00:17:15,100

more than one white crow in science to

431

00:17:21,210 --> 00:17:17,170

establish whether or not an induction is

432

00:17:22,680 --> 00:17:21,220

falsified or not okay so the unfortunate

433

00:17:24,570 --> 00:17:22,690

thing is sources of white crows have

434

00:17:27,660 --> 00:17:24,580

dried up with air every time you

435

00:17:28,770 --> 00:17:27,670

disprove a supernatural hypothesis you

436

00:17:30,450 --> 00:17:28,780

have disparate now I'm using

437

00:17:33,660 --> 00:17:30,460

supernatural very glibly here a

438

00:17:35,750 --> 00:17:33,670

non-physical hypothesis if you will then

439

00:17:39,240 --> 00:17:35,760

you have lost one of your white crows

440

00:17:40,920 --> 00:17:39,250

which is why the qualia what it's like

441

00:17:42,420 --> 00:17:40,930

knowledge arguments why all the

442

00:17:44,960 --> 00:17:42,430

arguments from consciousness don't work

443

00:17:46,909 --> 00:17:44,970

is because

444

00:17:48,919 --> 00:17:46,919

although well let's see I guess this is

445

00:17:51,169 --> 00:17:48,929

where I can talk about this they don't

446

00:17:53,810 --> 00:17:51,179

work because they're inconclusive we

447

00:17:55,580 --> 00:17:53,820

don't know what makes that what it's

448

00:17:56,870 --> 00:17:55,590

like feeling when we experience the

449

00:17:59,000 --> 00:17:56,880

color red we don't know

450

00:18:01,850 --> 00:17:59,010

neuroscience hasn't figured that out it

451

00:18:04,130 --> 00:18:01,860

may never figure it out but the fact is

452

00:18:05,480 --> 00:18:04,140

because we also can't prove that it is

453

00:18:06,830 --> 00:18:05,490

non because we can't prove that

454

00:18:09,830 --> 00:18:06,840

neuroscience will never figure it out

455

00:18:12,049 --> 00:18:09,840

it's inconclusive and an inconclusive

456

00:18:14,060 --> 00:18:12,059

argument it's like like the baseball

457

00:18:16,610 --> 00:18:14,070

rule tie goes to the runner if you have

458

00:18:18,350 --> 00:18:16,620

an inconclusive argument inference to

459

00:18:20,510 --> 00:18:18,360

the best explanation throws the argument

460

00:18:22,340 --> 00:18:20,520

to the physicalists because they've won

461

00:18:24,890 --> 00:18:22,350

so many times in the past the odds are

462

00:18:27,649 --> 00:18:24,900

high that we will find at least by their

463

00:18:30,260 --> 00:18:27,659

assessment the odds are very high that

464

00:18:32,450 --> 00:18:30,270

we'll we'll find an explanation within

465

00:18:35,299 --> 00:18:32,460

the physical domain for the what it's

466

00:18:38,090 --> 00:18:35,309

like the kweli experiences whatever in

467

00:18:39,710 --> 00:18:38,100

in consciousness at least that's the

468

00:18:42,320 --> 00:18:39,720

thinking and as long as you have no

469

00:18:47,600 --> 00:18:42,330

other white crows the physicalist win

470

00:18:51,950 --> 00:18:47,610

just by default okay however this should

471

00:18:55,610 --> 00:18:51,960

be sie es psi RV provides some excellent

472

00:18:58,130 --> 00:18:55,620

white crows still and the court is out

473

00:19:00,169 --> 00:18:58,140

on those they are not inconclusive in

474

00:19:03,080 --> 00:19:00,179

this case okay

475

00:19:05,210 --> 00:19:03,090

so physical isms Achilles heel is causal

476  
00:19:07,539 --> 00:19:05,220  
closure of the physical domain what this

477  
00:19:09,830 --> 00:19:07,549  
means is and this is a premise that

478  
00:19:12,500 --> 00:19:09,840  
physicalists assume this is not

479  
00:19:14,870 --> 00:19:12,510  
something you can prove it's assumed and

480  
00:19:17,029 --> 00:19:14,880  
based on a lot of the physical evidence

481  
00:19:19,549 --> 00:19:17,039  
but there's still plenty of evidence to

482  
00:19:20,980 --> 00:19:19,559  
be found so no causal influences can

483  
00:19:24,830 --> 00:19:20,990  
enter from outside the physical domain

484  
00:19:26,570 --> 00:19:24,840  
and no causal influences can exit the

485  
00:19:29,060 --> 00:19:26,580  
physical domain to re-enter elsewhere

486  
00:19:32,090 --> 00:19:29,070  
what that means is you have the physical

487  
00:19:33,649 --> 00:19:32,100  
universe that's all there is that's the

488  
00:19:35,049 --> 00:19:33,659

basic premise of physicalism the

489

00:19:37,399 --> 00:19:35,059

physical universe is all there is

490

00:19:39,500 --> 00:19:37,409

nothing can come in from outside to

491

00:19:41,690 --> 00:19:39,510

affect the physical universe if it did

492

00:19:43,190 --> 00:19:41,700

that would make it by certain definition

493

00:19:46,010 --> 00:19:43,200

non-physical okay

494

00:19:49,460 --> 00:19:46,020

and so that's excluded you also can't

495

00:19:51,409 --> 00:19:49,470

have something go from inside here up to

496

00:19:53,450 --> 00:19:51,419

the outside and erupt back into the

497

00:19:55,880 --> 00:19:53,460

inside you can't have a causal force do

498

00:19:58,670 --> 00:19:55,890

that either that violates closure and

499

00:20:00,500 --> 00:19:58,680

the whole reason is because there's mom

500

00:20:02,690 --> 00:20:00,510

nothing outside the physical universe

501  
00:20:05,720 --> 00:20:02,700  
for that to go into and so they just

502  
00:20:07,100 --> 00:20:05,730  
they basically postulate that there is

503  
00:20:08,360 --> 00:20:07,110  
nothing outside the physical universe

504  
00:20:09,920 --> 00:20:08,370  
that you cannot go outside the physical

505  
00:20:12,590 --> 00:20:09,930  
physical universe you can't bring

506  
00:20:15,920 --> 00:20:12,600  
anything in from the outside okay but

507  
00:20:17,630 --> 00:20:15,930  
that is an assumption and so that's the

508  
00:20:20,390 --> 00:20:17,640  
weak point of physicalism if you can

509  
00:20:22,760 --> 00:20:20,400  
show that closure is false you falsify

510  
00:20:24,230 --> 00:20:22,770  
physicalism and you allow the field to

511  
00:20:28,880 --> 00:20:24,240  
be open for all kinds of things

512  
00:20:30,380 --> 00:20:28,890  
including SCI ESP whatever okay so let's

513  
00:20:32,090 --> 00:20:30,390

talk about how this all work so I'm

514

00:20:33,140 --> 00:20:32,100

gonna get into causation a little bit

515

00:20:35,720 --> 00:20:33,150

here and I hope this will be a

516

00:20:37,610 --> 00:20:35,730

user-friendly way if not you can all

517

00:20:39,830 --> 00:20:37,620

pass out and or throw things at me then

518

00:20:42,380 --> 00:20:39,840

anyway there's three kinds of causal

519

00:20:44,600 --> 00:20:42,390

chains that I'm going to talk about one

520

00:20:46,850 --> 00:20:44,610

is your standard normal usual causal

521

00:20:49,520 --> 00:20:46,860

chain cause-and-effect deterministic

522

00:20:52,190 --> 00:20:49,530

sort of process and this consists of a

523

00:20:55,010 --> 00:20:52,200

series of sequential steps that are

524

00:20:58,370 --> 00:20:55,020

causally relevant okay you can trace

525

00:21:00,110 --> 00:20:58,380

this backwards from a terminal event to

526  
00:21:01,670 --> 00:21:00,120  
the ancestor event and in fact you can

527  
00:21:04,040 --> 00:21:01,680  
continue to trace it even further back

528  
00:21:05,090 --> 00:21:04,050  
from the ancestor event that's your

529  
00:21:06,740 --> 00:21:05,100  
standard thing you trace all the way

530  
00:21:08,720 --> 00:21:06,750  
back to the Big Bang assuming the Big

531  
00:21:11,630 --> 00:21:08,730  
Bang Big Bang really happened okay

532  
00:21:13,490 --> 00:21:11,640  
that's your standard causal chain so it

533  
00:21:15,860 --> 00:21:13,500  
goes like this and by the way this

534  
00:21:19,070 --> 00:21:15,870  
illustrates an actual family incident

535  
00:21:21,470 --> 00:21:19,080  
that happened many years ago and the boy

536  
00:21:23,540 --> 00:21:21,480  
that's implicated in this was about 5 at

537  
00:21:24,980 --> 00:21:23,550  
the time and he's now in the room at 27

538  
00:21:26,690 --> 00:21:24,990

so he'll get a real thrill out of this

539

00:21:28,040 --> 00:21:26,700

I'm sure at least this is how the story

540

00:21:30,970 --> 00:21:28,050

was told to me I found out later it may

541

00:21:33,020 --> 00:21:30,980

not be quite accurate okay so our

542

00:21:34,780 --> 00:21:33,030

terminating event is that a lamp

543

00:21:37,220 --> 00:21:34,790

striking the floor and shattering the

544

00:21:40,010 --> 00:21:37,230

boy has bumped the lamp which is what

545

00:21:43,250 --> 00:21:40,020

causes it to fall the dog bunts the boy

546

00:21:46,010 --> 00:21:43,260

which causes him to bump the lamp the

547

00:21:48,890 --> 00:21:46,020

explosion startles the dog okay

548

00:21:50,180 --> 00:21:48,900

a casserole dish explodes which is the

549

00:21:51,560 --> 00:21:50,190

explosion that startles a dog could

550

00:21:53,150 --> 00:21:51,570

cause the boy that bumped the lamp

551  
00:21:55,700 --> 00:21:53,160  
because they'll have to hit the floor

552  
00:21:57,830 --> 00:21:55,710  
right and the babysitter puts a

553  
00:21:59,300 --> 00:21:57,840  
casserole dish on the stove contrary to

554  
00:22:00,680 --> 00:21:59,310  
instructions in which he was supposed to

555  
00:22:01,970 --> 00:22:00,690  
put the ravioli in the casserole dish

556  
00:22:03,860 --> 00:22:01,980  
and put it in the oven he puts on the

557  
00:22:07,010 --> 00:22:03,870  
stove top instead instead and turns it

558  
00:22:09,800 --> 00:22:07,020  
on high very interesting change of

559  
00:22:11,680 --> 00:22:09,810  
events quite plausible turned out to be

560  
00:22:14,650 --> 00:22:11,690  
false but we won't go there okay

561  
00:22:16,390 --> 00:22:14,660  
okay so this is a standard causal chain

562  
00:22:18,070 --> 00:22:16,400  
you see how we chase that backwards okay

563  
00:22:19,900 --> 00:22:18,080

and for those of you can't follow the

564

00:22:23,530 --> 00:22:19,910

diagrams I have it linearly here but I

565

00:22:25,840 --> 00:22:23,540

only come back again okay all right so

566

00:22:27,600 --> 00:22:25,850

the next one and now this is terminology

567

00:22:29,770 --> 00:22:27,610

I've sort of invented there may be other

568

00:22:31,660 --> 00:22:29,780

similar concepts that have different

569

00:22:33,090 --> 00:22:31,670

terminology but capture the same thing

570

00:22:36,610 --> 00:22:33,100

but that's fine for here okay a

571

00:22:38,950 --> 00:22:36,620

truncated causal chain is a is one that

572

00:22:41,310 --> 00:22:38,960

violates closure okay it's a series of

573

00:22:44,290 --> 00:22:41,320

sequential a sequential

574

00:22:46,930 --> 00:22:44,300

causally relevant steps you can trace it

575

00:22:49,690 --> 00:22:46,940

backwards from the terminal event but at

576  
00:22:52,090 --> 00:22:49,700  
some point you discover the causal chain

577  
00:22:54,160 --> 00:22:52,100  
just sort of materialized in thin air

578  
00:22:56,200 --> 00:22:54,170  
and began from there that's why I call

579  
00:22:58,570 --> 00:22:56,210  
it truncated you don't have a genealogy

580  
00:23:02,440 --> 00:22:58,580  
you can't trace its answer's ancestry

581  
00:23:05,560 --> 00:23:02,450  
back past a certain point okay and so

582  
00:23:07,690 --> 00:23:05,570  
our our causal chain diagram goes

583  
00:23:09,340 --> 00:23:07,700  
something like this lamp strikes the

584  
00:23:12,250 --> 00:23:09,350  
floor and shatters the boy bumps the

585  
00:23:15,040 --> 00:23:12,260  
lamp the dog bumps the boy screaming

586  
00:23:17,140 --> 00:23:15,050  
troll startles the dog the screaming

587  
00:23:19,920 --> 00:23:17,150  
troll appears out of nowhere and we have

588  
00:23:22,330 --> 00:23:19,930

no idea where the troll came from okay

589

00:23:24,580 --> 00:23:22,340

that's a truncated causal chain you have

590

00:23:27,070 --> 00:23:24,590

this sudden appearance which some might

591

00:23:30,910 --> 00:23:27,080

attribute to supernatural or

592

00:23:33,370 --> 00:23:30,920

non-physical or whatever okay and again

593

00:23:35,860 --> 00:23:33,380

here's the linear thing all right good

594

00:23:37,630 --> 00:23:35,870

so now here's the third one this is the

595

00:23:39,250 --> 00:23:37,640

intermittently truncated causal chain

596

00:23:40,780 --> 00:23:39,260

see when you get into philosophy you've

597

00:23:43,840 --> 00:23:40,790

got to be able to handle these terms

598

00:23:49,000 --> 00:23:43,850

right and the longer you can make them

599

00:23:50,920 --> 00:23:49,010

the better your PhD is okay intermittent

600

00:23:52,960 --> 00:23:50,930

weak truncated causal chain series of

601  
00:23:55,480 --> 00:23:52,970  
sequential e causal irrelevant steps

602  
00:23:58,600 --> 00:23:55,490  
just like the others you can trace it

603  
00:24:01,350 --> 00:23:58,610  
backwards from a terminal event to a

604  
00:24:04,480 --> 00:24:01,360  
sudden eruption into the physical domain

605  
00:24:07,540 --> 00:24:04,490  
but the further thing is you know what

606  
00:24:09,220 --> 00:24:07,550  
its ancestral originating event is okay

607  
00:24:10,870 --> 00:24:09,230  
so here's I'm going to illustrate and

608  
00:24:12,850 --> 00:24:10,880  
this was a bit more complicated I hope

609  
00:24:15,100 --> 00:24:12,860  
this makes sense to you okay we've got

610  
00:24:17,410 --> 00:24:15,110  
the lamp in the floor the boy hits the

611  
00:24:19,630 --> 00:24:17,420  
lamp the doll gets the boy the screaming

612  
00:24:21,940 --> 00:24:19,640  
troll scares the dog the screaming troll

613  
00:24:24,270 --> 00:24:21,950

appears out of nowhere the troll

614

00:24:25,360 --> 00:24:24,280

reenters the physical domain from a

615

00:24:28,240 --> 00:24:25,370

previous

616

00:24:30,580 --> 00:24:28,250

exit out of the physical domain at which

617

00:24:32,830 --> 00:24:30,590

point the screaming troll disappears

618

00:24:33,970 --> 00:24:32,840

explosion startles the family troll

619

00:24:35,799 --> 00:24:33,980

that's how you got him in the first

620

00:24:37,690 --> 00:24:35,809

place he was part of your pet menagerie

621

00:24:40,330 --> 00:24:37,700

okay

622

00:24:43,840 --> 00:24:40,340

the excursion the babysitter puts the

623

00:24:46,750 --> 00:24:43,850

casual dish on the on the stove okay now

624

00:24:50,530 --> 00:24:46,760

here's the whole thing are you

625

00:24:51,900 --> 00:24:50,540

overwhelmed but you get the idea now now

626  
00:24:55,770 --> 00:24:51,910  
it's time for the laser pointer okay

627  
00:24:58,540 --> 00:24:55,780  
casserole dish that's a physical event

628  
00:25:00,820 --> 00:24:58,550  
casserole dish explodes that's a

629  
00:25:02,290 --> 00:25:00,830  
physical event the explosion startled

630  
00:25:05,560 --> 00:25:02,300  
the troll that also is the physical

631  
00:25:08,020 --> 00:25:05,570  
event the troll screams but he

632  
00:25:09,700 --> 00:25:08,030  
disappears that then goes outside of the

633  
00:25:11,590 --> 00:25:09,710  
physical domain okay

634  
00:25:13,419 --> 00:25:11,600  
he's floating around somewhere outside

635  
00:25:14,980 --> 00:25:13,429  
we don't care where he goes outside the

636  
00:25:18,730 --> 00:25:14,990  
physical domain he's out there somewhere

637  
00:25:20,200 --> 00:25:18,740  
right but then he pops back in and then

638  
00:25:21,669 --> 00:25:20,210

he scares the dog and the boy in the

639

00:25:22,960 --> 00:25:21,679

lamp on the floor and then that's a

640

00:25:26,260 --> 00:25:22,970

physical again so you have this

641

00:25:29,560 --> 00:25:26,270

intermediate section here that isn't

642

00:25:31,390 --> 00:25:29,570

within the physical domain and that is

643

00:25:33,190 --> 00:25:31,400

very problematical physicalism if you

644

00:25:36,000 --> 00:25:33,200

can demonstrate an intermittent

645

00:25:39,910 --> 00:25:36,010

truncated causal chain okay

646

00:25:42,490 --> 00:25:39,920

so there we are linearly again so here

647

00:25:45,810 --> 00:25:42,500

are some examples excuse me a truncated

648

00:25:48,070 --> 00:25:45,820

causal chains apparitions mediumship

649

00:25:50,200 --> 00:25:48,080

spontaneous sighs certain cases there's

650

00:25:52,600 --> 00:25:50,210

arguments here that can be made and

651  
00:25:56,710 --> 00:25:52,610  
interestingly the qualia consciousness

652  
00:26:00,310 --> 00:25:56,720  
argument because the the qualia if it is

653  
00:26:03,730 --> 00:26:00,320  
if qualia are non-physical as the

654  
00:26:06,850 --> 00:26:03,740  
argument goes then we don't know where

655  
00:26:10,090 --> 00:26:06,860  
they come from so that's a truncated

656  
00:26:16,030 --> 00:26:10,100  
causal chain now here are some examples

657  
00:26:17,380 --> 00:26:16,040  
of ITC seize the staring and other

658  
00:26:19,570 --> 00:26:17,390  
distance mental influence kinds of

659  
00:26:21,160 --> 00:26:19,580  
experiments okay in a staring experiment

660  
00:26:25,180 --> 00:26:21,170  
you have someone who places

661  
00:26:27,669 --> 00:26:25,190  
intentionality on another person through

662  
00:26:28,890 --> 00:26:27,679  
some intermediary means so the subject

663  
00:26:31,419 --> 00:26:28,900

doesn't know they're being stared at

664

00:26:34,810 --> 00:26:31,429

okay so that part of its known that's

665

00:26:36,700 --> 00:26:34,820

physically known then the person has the

666

00:26:38,350 --> 00:26:36,710

feeling either has the feeling of being

667

00:26:40,150 --> 00:26:38,360

stared at it indicates it or

668

00:26:41,410 --> 00:26:40,160

autonomic responses indicate there's

669

00:26:44,980 --> 00:26:41,420

some kind of attention being placed on

670

00:26:47,470 --> 00:26:44,990

that person but in a separate room or

671

00:26:49,480 --> 00:26:47,480

separate building whatever there is a

672

00:26:51,760 --> 00:26:49,490

cause a big hole in the causation

673

00:26:53,740 --> 00:26:51,770

between the staring and the perception

674

00:26:57,010 --> 00:26:53,750

of being stared at and that is your

675

00:26:58,720 --> 00:26:57,020

intermittent passage through the

676  
00:27:01,410 --> 00:26:58,730  
non-physical domain whatever that might

677  
00:27:03,550 --> 00:27:01,420  
be gone spelled as an example of that

678  
00:27:07,030 --> 00:27:03,560  
presentiments pyramus that Dean Radin

679  
00:27:09,160 --> 00:27:07,040  
has done a lot of or like that remote

680  
00:27:10,420 --> 00:27:09,170  
viewing is like that at particularly

681  
00:27:11,950 --> 00:27:10,430  
associated remote viewing and remote

682  
00:27:15,280 --> 00:27:11,960  
viewing you have a spatial interrupt

683  
00:27:17,260 --> 00:27:15,290  
okay the viewer is in a place sitting

684  
00:27:20,380 --> 00:27:17,270  
down given a coordinate asking number

685  
00:27:22,570 --> 00:27:20,390  
writes down gets the perceptions the

686  
00:27:25,330 --> 00:27:22,580  
target the viewer is known location and

687  
00:27:27,400 --> 00:27:25,340  
tasking is known the target is known to

688  
00:27:28,900 --> 00:27:27,410

everybody but the viewer presumably well

689

00:27:31,090 --> 00:27:28,910

and whoever's associated the viewers

690

00:27:33,220 --> 00:27:31,100

double blind okay but how the

691

00:27:36,430 --> 00:27:33,230

information gets from here to here is

692

00:27:38,680 --> 00:27:36,440

completely unknown and so you have an

693

00:27:39,760 --> 00:27:38,690

intermittent intermittently truncated

694

00:27:42,160 --> 00:27:39,770

causal chain all right

695

00:27:44,890 --> 00:27:42,170

associative remote viewing is both space

696

00:27:47,560 --> 00:27:44,900

and time it's a very powerful paradigm

697

00:27:49,800 --> 00:27:47,570

actually for trying to establish the

698

00:27:52,870 --> 00:27:49,810

reality of science P kinds of effects

699

00:27:54,580 --> 00:27:52,880

dowsing certain modes and there are

700

00:27:57,910 --> 00:27:54,590

plenty of others okay now here's the

701  
00:27:59,710 --> 00:27:57,920  
both TCC's nit sees violate the closure

702  
00:28:03,570 --> 00:27:59,720  
principle how am I on time I have been

703  
00:28:05,530 --> 00:28:03,580  
looking okay we may be good then okay

704  
00:28:07,660 --> 00:28:05,540  
both of them violate the closure

705  
00:28:10,750 --> 00:28:07,670  
principle but TCC's are not sufficiently

706  
00:28:13,060 --> 00:28:10,760  
convincing it's because you don't know

707  
00:28:15,640 --> 00:28:13,070  
where they start and the physicalists

708  
00:28:19,240 --> 00:28:15,650  
get by the consciousness argument by

709  
00:28:21,370 --> 00:28:19,250  
saying this okay we don't know why you

710  
00:28:24,040 --> 00:28:21,380  
have the feel you do when you see the

711  
00:28:25,920 --> 00:28:24,050  
color red or you feel warm sensation on

712  
00:28:29,050 --> 00:28:25,930  
your arm or whatever we don't know why

713  
00:28:31,450 --> 00:28:29,060

but you can't show us where it comes

714

00:28:33,280 --> 00:28:31,460

from and we have very good confidence

715

00:28:35,950 --> 00:28:33,290

that neuroscience will eventually be

716

00:28:37,930 --> 00:28:35,960

able to explain it and so they can say

717

00:28:39,460 --> 00:28:37,940

we think there's a physical explanation

718

00:28:41,980 --> 00:28:39,470

we don't know what it is but we think

719

00:28:44,140 --> 00:28:41,990

there is okay and anytime you have a TCC

720

00:28:47,830 --> 00:28:44,150

and you don't know what the origin is

721

00:28:49,360 --> 00:28:47,840

it's very easy to dismiss and just say

722

00:28:51,389 --> 00:28:49,370

well we think there's a physical

723

00:28:52,680 --> 00:28:51,399

explanation okay and they would have

724

00:28:55,289 --> 00:28:52,690

reasonable grounds for that because in

725

00:28:57,719 --> 00:28:55,299

most cases there would be however I

726

00:29:01,079 --> 00:28:57,729

TCC's are more powerful in this respect

727

00:29:02,899 --> 00:29:01,089

okay because you know the starting point

728

00:29:05,249 --> 00:29:02,909

you know the origin of the causal chain

729

00:29:06,570 --> 00:29:05,259

you can identify the point where that

730

00:29:08,129 --> 00:29:06,580

chain disappears from the physical

731

00:29:10,560 --> 00:29:08,139

universe and you can identify the point

732

00:29:12,269 --> 00:29:10,570

where it comes back in it's a lot easier

733

00:29:14,279 --> 00:29:12,279

to measure and observe and tell what's

734

00:29:16,529 --> 00:29:14,289

going on there and that's why in fact

735

00:29:19,229 --> 00:29:16,539

the ESP experiments and and other side

736

00:29:22,469 --> 00:29:19,239

related experiments that involve ITC C's

737

00:29:24,180 --> 00:29:22,479

are so powerful which is why the

738

00:29:26,430 --> 00:29:24,190

physicals are scared to death of them

739

00:29:28,469 --> 00:29:26,440

I've been reading reading physical as

740

00:29:30,680 --> 00:29:28,479

literature for a long time and these

741

00:29:34,469 --> 00:29:30,690

folks won't even look at the evidence

742

00:29:35,940 --> 00:29:34,479

because they know what the implications

743

00:29:38,879 --> 00:29:35,950

are if they acknowledge that this stuff

744

00:29:40,200 --> 00:29:38,889

is real and so they refuse to even

745

00:29:41,909 --> 00:29:40,210

accept the evidence without even

746

00:29:45,209 --> 00:29:41,919

investigating it for the most part

747

00:29:46,979 --> 00:29:45,219

they'll rely on third party skeptic

748

00:29:51,810 --> 00:29:46,989

assessments of us and stuff and assume

749

00:29:53,459 --> 00:29:51,820

that that's that that's accurate okay so

750

00:29:58,499 --> 00:29:53,469

that's the first part that's the first

751  
00:29:59,789 --> 00:29:58,509  
way that psy is essentially essential to

752  
00:30:02,279 --> 00:29:59,799  
preserving the whole idea of

753  
00:30:04,499 --> 00:30:02,289  
consciousness as and as conscious as in

754  
00:30:06,869 --> 00:30:04,509  
itself okay so here's part two I'm going

755  
00:30:09,149 --> 00:30:06,879  
to hit this fairly quickly it does the

756  
00:30:11,579 --> 00:30:09,159  
further thing for us okay we are we

757  
00:30:13,560 --> 00:30:11,589  
using kin terms of consciousness in

758  
00:30:16,049 --> 00:30:13,570  
terms of being awake and aware and all

759  
00:30:18,810 --> 00:30:16,059  
that I refer to that as conscious

760  
00:30:20,459 --> 00:30:18,820  
awareness we also have of course the

761  
00:30:21,779 --> 00:30:20,469  
subconscious and maybe the unconscious I

762  
00:30:23,310 --> 00:30:21,789  
don't want going to all of that but

763  
00:30:24,629 --> 00:30:23,320

we've got conscious aware since I'm cut

764

00:30:26,759 --> 00:30:24,639

subconscious and we're used to thinking

765

00:30:30,359 --> 00:30:26,769

in that dichotomy kind of a dualistic

766

00:30:32,969 --> 00:30:30,369

way of thinking about consciousness okay

767

00:30:35,459 --> 00:30:32,979

and I think we make a mistake in

768

00:30:37,229 --> 00:30:35,469

dividing those things and it allows the

769

00:30:39,779 --> 00:30:37,239

physicalist actually some leverage when

770

00:30:42,440 --> 00:30:39,789

we do that and this is the mistake that

771

00:30:45,570 --> 00:30:42,450

Susan Blackmore makes in that she

772

00:30:47,339 --> 00:30:45,580

focuses only unconscious awareness as as

773

00:30:49,109 --> 00:30:47,349

consciousness when I think we need to

774

00:30:50,279 --> 00:30:49,119

include both of them and this was

775

00:30:51,659 --> 00:30:50,289

actually mentioned yesterday and I've

776

00:30:53,849 --> 00:30:51,669

already forgotten who talked about it

777

00:30:55,529 --> 00:30:53,859

talked about having a broader notion of

778

00:30:58,469 --> 00:30:55,539

consciousness where where the whole

779

00:31:01,049 --> 00:30:58,479

human mental life whether it's above or

780

00:31:03,029 --> 00:31:01,059

below the liminal threshold is regarded

781

00:31:04,469 --> 00:31:03,039

as conscious this consciousness and I

782

00:31:04,799 --> 00:31:04,479

think we need to address it that way

783

00:31:07,350 --> 00:31:04,809

else

784

00:31:08,430 --> 00:31:07,360

I'll explain why okay first of all I'm

785

00:31:10,289 --> 00:31:08,440

going to give you some remote viewing

786

00:31:12,330 --> 00:31:10,299

examples because they'll illustrate my

787

00:31:13,680 --> 00:31:12,340

point and plus you'll think they're cool

788

00:31:15,119 --> 00:31:13,690

I hope okay

789

00:31:17,669 --> 00:31:15,129

so this is a famous example from

790

00:31:19,139 --> 00:31:17,679

Stargate this was the famous typhoon

791

00:31:21,450 --> 00:31:19,149

submarine session that Jill mcmoneagle

792

00:31:23,249 --> 00:31:21,460

did they were given a coordinate

793

00:31:25,110 --> 00:31:23,259

geographic coordinate and they started

794

00:31:27,180 --> 00:31:25,120

describing this big building which was

795

00:31:28,499 --> 00:31:27,190

the goal now we knew what the building

796

00:31:30,269 --> 00:31:28,509

looked like we didn't know was going on

797

00:31:31,769 --> 00:31:30,279

inside of is this huge massive building

798

00:31:33,509 --> 00:31:31,779

the Soviets have built in a shipyard in

799

00:31:34,499 --> 00:31:33,519

the Kola Peninsula it's about a quarter

800

00:31:37,289 --> 00:31:34,509

of a mile from the water

801  
00:31:38,730 --> 00:31:37,299  
jace the joint known in national

802  
00:31:40,259 --> 00:31:38,740  
security council was afraid they were

803  
00:31:41,580 --> 00:31:40,269  
building a fleet size aircraft carrier

804  
00:31:43,289 --> 00:31:41,590  
in there that's how big the building was

805  
00:31:44,580 --> 00:31:43,299  
okay and that would have changed the

806  
00:31:47,639 --> 00:31:44,590  
balance of power those are all kinds of

807  
00:31:49,320 --> 00:31:47,649  
worries about it so somebody on the

808  
00:31:52,080 --> 00:31:49,330  
council a staffer on the council knew

809  
00:31:53,700 --> 00:31:52,090  
about the RV program and tasked the

810  
00:31:55,440 --> 00:31:53,710  
program with trying to find out what was

811  
00:31:56,879 --> 00:31:55,450  
in the building so they described the

812  
00:31:59,009 --> 00:31:56,889  
building through these sketches and then

813  
00:32:00,169 --> 00:31:59,019

once they had drawn convincing sketches

814

00:32:02,700 --> 00:32:00,179

of what the building looked like and

815

00:32:05,070 --> 00:32:02,710

shown that through ESP they could

816

00:32:06,450 --> 00:32:05,080

recognize it they show them the picture

817

00:32:08,070 --> 00:32:06,460

of it and then they went on describe the

818

00:32:10,440 --> 00:32:08,080

insides of it okay there's actual

819

00:32:11,879 --> 00:32:10,450

building today thanks to is it

820

00:32:13,499 --> 00:32:11,889

perestroika or the fall of the Berlin

821

00:32:15,989 --> 00:32:13,509

Wall whatever we can now get pictures of

822

00:32:18,359 --> 00:32:15,999

these places okay there's the building

823

00:32:23,359 --> 00:32:18,369

again okay and there's a satellite view

824

00:32:28,109 --> 00:32:23,369

of it okay there's a there's a viewer

825

00:32:30,659 --> 00:32:28,119

sketch of it based on just RV sort of

826

00:32:32,070 --> 00:32:30,669

information and how it looks and then

827

00:32:33,720 --> 00:32:32,080

they said that inside this building are

828

00:32:38,399 --> 00:32:33,730

these things that either are pregnant

829

00:32:39,600 --> 00:32:38,409

kazoos or submarines okay more diagrams

830

00:32:41,190 --> 00:32:39,610

I'm gonna I'm going to kind of burn

831

00:32:42,659 --> 00:32:41,200

through these because I'm running short

832

00:32:44,100 --> 00:32:42,669

on time picture of what the inside of it

833

00:32:45,840 --> 00:32:44,110

actually looks as compared to help what

834

00:32:49,289 --> 00:32:45,850

they sketched remember this is all RV

835

00:32:51,149 --> 00:32:49,299

data and you'll explain how significant

836

00:32:52,649 --> 00:32:51,159

that is in a minute okay again they

837

00:32:54,930 --> 00:32:52,659

describe this huge crane and all that

838

00:32:56,549 --> 00:32:54,940

and then gentlemen want to go drew this

839

00:32:59,009 --> 00:32:56,559

sketch of the submarine and described it

840

00:33:00,480 --> 00:32:59,019

okay and he put the missile tubes in

841

00:33:01,859 --> 00:33:00,490

front of the sail it's the sale or the

842

00:33:03,570 --> 00:33:01,869

conning tower which at that time was

843

00:33:05,279 --> 00:33:03,580

heresy considered heresy by naval

844

00:33:07,379 --> 00:33:05,289

architect because you never put missile

845

00:33:10,289 --> 00:33:07,389

tubes in front of the of the sail on the

846

00:33:12,180 --> 00:33:10,299

sub because as you when you open the

847

00:33:14,129 --> 00:33:12,190

tubes the water had pour in right okay

848

00:33:18,359 --> 00:33:14,139

well anyway and he described this to

849

00:33:18,899 --> 00:33:18,369

this sub as being huge okay and here

850

00:33:20,759 --> 00:33:18,909

actually

851  
00:33:22,529 --> 00:33:20,769  
shows you a picture of a typhoon tied up

852  
00:33:26,249 --> 00:33:22,539  
at the very dock and many years later

853  
00:33:27,599 --> 00:33:26,259  
next to Kiev class whatever you want to

854  
00:33:29,159 --> 00:33:27,609  
call it service combat it's kind of an

855  
00:33:30,690 --> 00:33:29,169  
aircraft carrier and you can see that

856  
00:33:32,820 --> 00:33:30,700  
sub is huge because this is an aircraft

857  
00:33:37,649 --> 00:33:32,830  
carrier sized vessel here and that sub

858  
00:33:38,879 --> 00:33:37,659  
is huge okay so anyway ten months after

859  
00:33:41,159 --> 00:33:38,889  
the last remote viewing session they

860  
00:33:42,629 --> 00:33:41,169  
floated out the typhoon the NSC had

861  
00:33:44,489 --> 00:33:42,639  
thought the reviewing stuff was bogus

862  
00:33:46,619 --> 00:33:44,499  
nobody in the Western world knew what

863  
00:33:48,989 --> 00:33:46,629

was in that building and yet when the

864

00:33:51,180 --> 00:33:48,999

sub came out they found out that it was

865

00:33:52,680 --> 00:33:51,190

exactly as Joe mcmoneagle and the other

866

00:33:55,289 --> 00:33:52,690

viewer that worked on this had described

867

00:33:57,299 --> 00:33:55,299

it you can see how the compare there's a

868

00:33:59,009 --> 00:33:57,309

few differences but you can understand

869

00:34:00,149 --> 00:33:59,019

how those would be these are the things

870

00:34:01,469 --> 00:34:00,159

that were correct there were three to

871

00:34:03,659 --> 00:34:01,479

four submarines inside the building

872

00:34:05,669 --> 00:34:03,669

construction was of a huge seven with

873

00:34:07,409 --> 00:34:05,679

tubes for the sail I got one minute to

874

00:34:09,500 --> 00:34:07,419

go so if would be launched in several

875

00:34:13,409 --> 00:34:09,510

months ok so here's some more examples

876

00:34:15,990 --> 00:34:13,419

you see how close those come this is an

877

00:34:17,369 --> 00:34:16,000

ARV you wouldn't know what that was

878

00:34:20,430 --> 00:34:17,379

looking at it until you saw the feedback

879

00:34:22,470 --> 00:34:20,440

photo now I've got one three sessions on

880

00:34:26,279 --> 00:34:22,480

the same target at in different years

881

00:34:28,680 --> 00:34:26,289

all done double blind okay so this

882

00:34:31,440 --> 00:34:28,690

target is thick gray structure colors

883

00:34:32,190 --> 00:34:31,450

involved gray brown and ochre that was

884

00:34:34,200 --> 00:34:32,200

the target

885

00:34:35,609 --> 00:34:34,210

here's another session on the same thing

886

00:34:39,930 --> 00:34:35,619

see the multiple structures here is

887

00:34:44,309 --> 00:34:39,940

showing whoops yeah also same color same

888

00:34:49,169 --> 00:34:47,309

this one was quite striking tah also

889

00:34:51,990 --> 00:34:49,179

talking about sandy and rocky okay the

890

00:34:53,669 --> 00:34:52,000

point of this is that all of these

891

00:34:55,500 --> 00:34:53,679

things these colors everything involved

892

00:34:56,819 --> 00:34:55,510

qualia they involve conscious experience

893

00:34:58,589 --> 00:34:56,829

and yet that is emerging from the

894

00:35:00,240 --> 00:34:58,599

subconscious remote viewing is clearly

895

00:35:01,980 --> 00:35:00,250

implicated in subconscious experience

896

00:35:04,380 --> 00:35:01,990

that stuff's coming up from it's time

897

00:35:08,370 --> 00:35:04,390

for Q&A okay so here's my final point

898

00:35:10,319 --> 00:35:08,380

two seconds okay according to black more

899

00:35:12,210 --> 00:35:10,329

conscious involves perception cognition

900

00:35:13,710 --> 00:35:12,220

for all experience intentionality the RV

901  
00:35:16,529 --> 00:35:13,720  
shows that that stuff's going on below

902  
00:35:18,480 --> 00:35:16,539  
the liminal threshold as well we need to

903  
00:35:21,420 --> 00:35:18,490  
we specify consciousness too narrowly

904  
00:35:23,299 --> 00:35:21,430  
and limiting helps the physicalist by

905  
00:35:26,220 --> 00:35:23,309  
limiting our specification of

906  
00:35:27,720 --> 00:35:26,230  
consciousness and so two ways ESP helps

907  
00:35:29,849 --> 00:35:27,730  
as evidence that's physicalism is false

908  
00:35:32,370 --> 00:35:29,859  
and that specification of consciousness

909  
00:35:41,660 --> 00:35:32,380  
is too narrow we can

910  
00:35:46,920 --> 00:35:45,810  
so information if you're interested here

911  
00:35:57,180 --> 00:35:46,930  
you go okay

912  
00:36:00,090 --> 00:35:57,190  
thank you very much thank you polls Jim

913  
00:36:02,250 --> 00:36:00,100

beekler I agree with almost everything

914

00:36:03,600 --> 00:36:02,260

you say but I would go and I think you

915

00:36:05,070 --> 00:36:03,610

did a very good job some things you say

916

00:36:06,990 --> 00:36:05,080

I say in my own writings but I would go

917

00:36:10,290 --> 00:36:07,000

a bit further and that you're talking

918

00:36:12,930 --> 00:36:10,300

about physicalism but there's a further

919

00:36:14,580 --> 00:36:12,940

separation physical world off things

920

00:36:16,590 --> 00:36:14,590

that are material or physical but not

921

00:36:17,970 --> 00:36:16,600

everything is physical as material we

922

00:36:19,230 --> 00:36:17,980

also have electromagnetic and

923

00:36:22,470 --> 00:36:19,240

gravitational fields which are

924

00:36:25,040 --> 00:36:22,480

completely physical but non material so

925

00:36:29,010 --> 00:36:25,050

I would posit the consciousness is

926

00:36:31,410 --> 00:36:29,020

actually a field struck or life as a

927

00:36:34,410 --> 00:36:31,420

field structure mind is electromagnetic

928

00:36:37,530 --> 00:36:34,420

structure and consciousness self is

929

00:36:39,330 --> 00:36:37,540

magnetic potential structure completely

930

00:36:42,540 --> 00:36:39,340

non material but still physical okay

931

00:36:45,680 --> 00:36:42,550

first of all I agree if I'd had 45

932

00:36:47,730 --> 00:36:45,690

minutes I'd gone further to okay but

933

00:36:49,680 --> 00:36:47,740

physicalism actually does include and

934

00:36:52,320 --> 00:36:49,690

that's why I said energy matter and

935

00:36:53,580 --> 00:36:52,330

energy so physical is materialism and

936

00:36:56,010 --> 00:36:53,590

physical isms terms are almost

937

00:36:57,300 --> 00:36:56,020

isomorphic there are some nuances that I

938

00:36:59,730 --> 00:36:57,310

don't think make a big difference but

939

00:37:01,770 --> 00:36:59,740

but nonetheless physical physical ISM is

940

00:37:03,870 --> 00:37:01,780

kind of the modern term for materialism

941

00:37:05,550 --> 00:37:03,880

however I would disagree with your

942

00:37:08,850 --> 00:37:05,560

premise about electromagnetism in mind

943

00:37:10,980 --> 00:37:08,860

all of the evidence the really strongly

944

00:37:13,230 --> 00:37:10,990

attested evidence seems to indicate that

945

00:37:15,660 --> 00:37:13,240

there is not that that there are non

946

00:37:17,220 --> 00:37:15,670

electromagnetic components to size

947

00:37:18,900 --> 00:37:17,230

phenomenon and I think Dean would

948

00:37:21,600 --> 00:37:18,910

probably support that we'll find out a

949

00:37:23,580 --> 00:37:21,610

little bit there was a long series of

950

00:37:25,860 --> 00:37:23,590

experiments done at SR I some stuff is

951  
00:37:26,940 --> 00:37:25,870  
done at SAIC where they tried to find

952  
00:37:29,430 --> 00:37:26,950  
out if there's an electromagnetic

953  
00:37:31,620 --> 00:37:29,440  
component to it and their final

954  
00:37:32,880 --> 00:37:31,630  
conclusion was that there is not oh here

955  
00:37:36,910 --> 00:37:32,890  
uh CIL's up here would you agree with

956  
00:37:42,920 --> 00:37:36,920  
that Russell he does okay all right

957  
00:37:44,300 --> 00:37:42,930  
yeah okay all right so anyway that's we

958  
00:37:46,250 --> 00:37:44,310  
could have a big debate about that and

959  
00:37:50,089 --> 00:37:46,260  
there are ongoing debates but that would

960  
00:37:52,660 --> 00:37:50,099  
be my response to that so okay the other

961  
00:37:56,510 --> 00:37:52,670  
question yeah hi my name is Kenny Arnett

962  
00:37:59,000 --> 00:37:56,520  
I am very impressed with your analysis

963  
00:38:00,470 --> 00:37:59,010

of causal chains and it bears some

964

00:38:02,480 --> 00:38:00,480

resemblance to some things I've done in

965

00:38:03,890 --> 00:38:02,490

the past and I'd like to suggest to you

966

00:38:06,290 --> 00:38:03,900

that there are some other sources of

967

00:38:08,690 --> 00:38:06,300

white crows in addition to sign and

968

00:38:11,720 --> 00:38:08,700

those would be the near-death experience

969

00:38:14,300 --> 00:38:11,730

after death communications and evidence

970

00:38:15,890 --> 00:38:14,310

of reincarnation okay so I think that

971

00:38:17,420 --> 00:38:15,900

there's more out there that we could

972

00:38:18,980 --> 00:38:17,430

bring in to this kind of analysis it

973

00:38:22,010 --> 00:38:18,990

kind of depends on how you parse the

974

00:38:24,140 --> 00:38:22,020

word sigh and when I use it I kind of

975

00:38:26,330 --> 00:38:24,150

include those things as well since we

976

00:38:29,960 --> 00:38:26,340

really don't know the etiology of those

977

00:38:31,970 --> 00:38:29,970

things right I kind of embrace anything

978

00:38:36,140 --> 00:38:31,980

that seems to go beyond the physical

979

00:38:40,570 --> 00:38:36,150

domain under the category okay another

980

00:38:43,970 --> 00:38:40,580

question and rebound in a causal chain

981

00:38:46,970 --> 00:38:43,980

going from one step to the next is a

982

00:38:51,680 --> 00:38:46,980

hundred percent certain in your

983

00:38:54,260 --> 00:38:51,690

intermediate interrupted one the question

984

00:38:57,230 --> 00:38:54,270

is whether the screaming troll that

985

00:39:01,070 --> 00:38:57,240

disappears is identical with the one

986

00:39:04,550 --> 00:39:01,080

that reappears and that's a transporter

987

00:39:07,609 --> 00:39:04,560

problem in Star Trek isn't it well it

988

00:39:11,540 --> 00:39:07,619

seems to me that the problem of

989

00:39:14,859 --> 00:39:11,550

identifying those things comes down to

990

00:39:20,240 --> 00:39:14,869

always a statistical and a probabilistic

991

00:39:25,400 --> 00:39:20,250

argument so the the the question still

992

00:39:28,000 --> 00:39:25,410

remains to find convincing arguments

993

00:39:31,220 --> 00:39:28,010

which are statistical and probabilistic

994

00:39:34,040 --> 00:39:31,230

instead of hundred percents

995

00:39:35,960 --> 00:39:34,050

well first of all you're raising

996

00:39:37,690 --> 00:39:35,970

problems that are both epistemic and

997

00:39:40,250 --> 00:39:37,700

metaphysical in terms of philosophy

998

00:39:41,720 --> 00:39:40,260

cause there's lots of debate still going

999

00:39:43,609 --> 00:39:41,730

on what causality is how it all works

1000

00:39:47,720 --> 00:39:43,619

together and all that kind of thing and

1001  
00:39:49,430 --> 00:39:47,730  
how we know what we know it goes into

1002  
00:39:50,839 --> 00:39:49,440  
the statistics than that and and

1003  
00:39:52,309 --> 00:39:50,849  
fact there's just no time to address

1004  
00:39:53,690 --> 00:39:52,319  
those kind of issues here I had to

1005  
00:39:56,569 --> 00:39:53,700  
simplify in order to fit it all together

1006  
00:39:59,000 --> 00:39:56,579  
but in fact if we go with your premise

1007  
00:40:01,250 --> 00:39:59,010  
there is one problem we have to treat

1008  
00:40:03,740 --> 00:40:01,260  
the rest of the world the same way and

1009  
00:40:05,930 --> 00:40:03,750  
it's not just sigh experiences it's not

1010  
00:40:07,460 --> 00:40:05,940  
just these kind of extra physical kinds

1011  
00:40:09,890 --> 00:40:07,470  
of things that occur that you treat that

1012  
00:40:11,569 --> 00:40:09,900  
way but the rest of our perception of

1013  
00:40:14,839 --> 00:40:11,579

the rest world has similar problems and

1014

00:40:16,849 --> 00:40:14,849

so in fact life is a statistical game we

1015

00:40:19,040 --> 00:40:16,859

gauge the probability of the truth of

1016

00:40:20,839 --> 00:40:19,050

what we know based on how it fits into

1017

00:40:24,200 --> 00:40:20,849

the context or coheres with the rest of

1018

00:40:25,670 --> 00:40:24,210

everything else that we know and so we

1019

00:40:27,530 --> 00:40:25,680

just weigh evidence that's all we do is

1020

00:40:29,059 --> 00:40:27,540

weigh evidence and we think we know

1021

00:40:31,010 --> 00:40:29,069

something but we only know it better

1022

00:40:32,780 --> 00:40:31,020

than we then we know something else it